

**To:** Macpherson, Alex[Macpherson.Alex@epa.gov]; Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Alsalam, Jameel[Alsalam.Jameel@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tue 6/9/2015 6:03:48 PM  
**Subject:** RE: O&G Preamble and RIA

Yes, I now remember Alex M mentioned something about this to me when I got back from maternity leave. Just still catching up.

I will be interested to see the magnitude of the CO2 emissions impacts though when you get them.

Thanks!

Elizabeth

**From:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 09, 2015 2:02 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Alsalam, Jameel; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: O&G Preamble and RIA

OK. That discussion was an joint effort btwn OAP, OP, and OAQPS, btw.

The contractors are also to revise the secondary emissions numbers; hopefully they will have them by Friday

Alex

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 09, 2015 1:59 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Macpherson, Alex  
**Cc:** Alsalam, Jameel; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: O&G Preamble and RIA

Oops, sorry I see now I should read the discussion around the tables in 4.7 more closely. Will do that now.

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 09, 2015 1:51 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Macpherson, Alex  
**Cc:** Alsalam, Jameel; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: O&G Preamble and RIA

Hi all,

# Ex 5

Elizabeth

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 09, 2015 11:10 AM  
**To:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Cc:** Alsalam, Jameel; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Subject:** O&G Preamble and RIA

No action needed, just a heads up that I've carried various updates from landfills over to the oil and gas preamble and RIA. The oil and gas preamble now includes the shortened version of the SC-CH<sub>4</sub> discussion (from landfills EG preamble), the latest numbers, and net benefits in 2020 of **Ex 5**, along with a note about numbers not summing due to rounding. The O&G RIA

now includes latest numbers and the SC-CH4 discussion from the landfills RIA.

Elizabeth is reviewing the SC-CH4 in O&G RIA as well.

**Non-Responsive**

Thanks,  
Kate

**To:** Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tue 6/9/2015 12:52:25 PM  
**Subject:** RE: O&G RIA

Super, thanks! Then I will turn to that now.

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 09, 2015 8:52 AM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Subject:** O&G RIA

Thanks, Elizabeth. Just a heads up that I finished updating the numbers in the oil and gas RIA. Both the text and numbers should now be current for the SC-CH4 discussion.

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 09, 2015 8:23 AM  
**To:** Marsh, Karen; Thundiyil, Karen  
**Cc:** Ward, Hillary; Fulcher, Charles; Shouse, Kate; Barron, Alex; McGartland, Al; Moore, Chris; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** suggestions for shortening benefits language for Landfills EG

Hi Karen,

Not sure if you have already received this through other channels (I think Alex B. was trying to reach Peter T. yesterday), but we had a chance to discuss the status of the landfills benefits language with Joel and he had two suggestions:

- 1) We should try to update all numbers and text in both packages to reflect the SCC correction. This includes the text edits we have already sent along, and Kate is working with Charlie on updating all the numbers in the NSPS supplemental, EG preamble, and RIA.
- 2) It might be best to shorten the benefits discussion in the EG preamble too. Attached is a suggested revision that cuts it down to about 9 pages. This version reflects edits from Kate as well.

Hope this helps. Please feel free to call me with any questions etc.

Thanks!

Elizabeth

Elizabeth Kopits, Ph.D.

National Center for Environmental Economics

Office of Policy, US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, MC 1809T

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 566-2299

**From:** Marsh, Karen

**Sent:** Thursday, June 04, 2015 3:01 PM

**To:** Thundiyil, Karen

**Cc:** Ward, Hillary; Fulcher, Charles; Shouse, Kate; Kopits, Elizabeth

**Subject:** Updated benefits language for Landfills NSPS

Karen,

Attached is the updated version of the benefits language for the Landfills NSPS. This language will go immediately following Table 1 in the preamble. This is more in line with the amount of detail needed for the preamble. Please

review this language and let me know if you have any additional comments or edits. Once we receive those edits we can finalize the package and have it sent back through the proper channels for submittal to OMB.

Thanks,

Karen

\*\*\*\*\*

Karen R. Marsh, PE

US EPA, OAQPS, Sectors Policies and Programs Division

Fuels and Incineration Group

109 TW Alexander Drive, Mail Code E143-05

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

Direct: (919) 541-1065; email: [marsh.karen@epa.gov](mailto:marsh.karen@epa.gov)

**To:** Friedman, Kristina[Friedman.Kristina@epa.gov]; Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Fawcett, Allen[Fawcett.Allen@epa.gov]; Sarofim, Marcus[Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov]; Kocchi, Suzanne[Kocchi.Suzanne@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tue 6/9/2015 11:06:56 AM  
**Subject:** RE: EPW QFRs - Due COB 6/3

Last I heard (informally and third hand) is that it won't be before the week of the 22<sup>nd</sup>.

**From:** Friedman, Kristina  
**Sent:** Monday, June 08, 2015 6:26 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Fawcett, Allen; Sarofim, Marcus; Kocchi, Suzanne; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Subject:** RE: EPW QFRs - Due COB 6/3

Thanks, Kate. Did you have an update on the RTC timing?

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 03, 2015 12:07 PM  
**To:** Friedman, Kristina  
**Cc:** Fawcett, Allen; Sarofim, Marcus; Kocchi, Suzanne; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Subject:** RE: EPW QFRs - Due COB 6/3

**Ex 5**

I've flagged this paragraph with a comment bubble and explained in red font. I will let you know as soon as OMB publishes the RTC. Please let me know if you need anything else.

Finally, the SCC response also reflects input from OP.

Thanks,  
Kate

**From:** Friedman, Kristina  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 26, 2015 5:26 PM  
**To:** Sarofim, Marcus; Birnbaum, Rona; Shouse, Kate; Fawcett, Allen; Irving, Bill  
**Cc:** Kocchi, Suzanne  
**Subject:** EPW QFRs - Due COB 6/3

Hi,

We received QFRs from Janet's February EPW hearing on 111(d). Attached please find a subset for CCD review (the list of which is included below). Could you please review/revise the attached responses by COB Wednesday, 6/3? The IO took a shot at drafting responses, but your review is greatly appreciated. Please feel free to pull in others across OAP as necessary (or let me know if they should be reassigned within OAP). I will share our responses, as appropriate, with OAQPS before they are sent forward for OGC review. If you need additional time, please let me know.

Thanks!  
Kristina

Sessions 1 (CSIB/CEB)

Vitter SCC (CEB)

Vitter European (CPB/CEB)

Vitter Science 1-10 (CSIB/CPB)

*Kristina Friedman*



*Office of Atmospheric Programs*

*U.S. Environmental Protection Agency*

*Phone: (202) 343-9281*

**To:** Roberts, Martha[Roberts.Martha@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Mon 6/1/2015 5:31:26 PM  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Sure, will do. Thanks!

**From:** Roberts, Martha  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 1:30 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Could you send it to Joel (as an FYI but thoughts are welcome) and cc Al, Alex and myself?

Thanks so much,

Martha

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 1:11 PM  
**To:** Roberts, Martha  
**Cc:** Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

OK, great. Is there anything else you need from us? Would you like me to send it forward to Joel (and then Robin) then, or did you want to ?

Kate will also be sending it up her OAR chain, noting that OP will be submitting the same.

Elizabeth

**From:** Roberts, Martha  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 12:55 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Marten, Alex  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Looks fine, thanks for taking a cut

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 12:49 PM  
**To:** Roberts, Martha; Marten, Alex  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Hi Martha,

How about this? (I think I am working off the latest version.) I also made the last point more prominent, per Marilyn's suggestion below.

Elizabeth

**From:** Roberts, Martha  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 12:18 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Hi all,

Quoc Nguyen from GLO reviewed the statement and let me know she had no edits; edits from Marilyn Kuray (CCILO) are below. If we want to get this to Joel today, I suggest we incorporate these and press ahead – if Steve Silverman sends anything along later we can incorporate them then.

## Ex 5

Martha

**From:** Kuray, Marilyn

**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 8:45 AM

**To:** Roberts, Martha; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn; Silverman, Steven

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate

**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Martha,

There's not much here that is in my area. One question I have is whether your intended audience will know what you mean by "disbenefits." I think the last sentence is very important and perhaps should be moved up to the beginning of the implications section.

I also would suggest adding a bit to that sentence:

## Ex 5

\*\*\*\*\*

Marilyn J. Kuray  
Administrative Law Team Leader

Cross-Cutting Law Office  
US EPA Office of General Counsel  
Tel: (202) 564-3449

7426H WJC North

NOTICE: This communication may contain deliberative, privileged, or other confidential information. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you have received this communication in error, please delete the copy you received, and do not print, copy, re-transmit, disseminate or otherwise use the information. Thank you.

**From:** Roberts, Martha  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 8:28 AM  
**To:** Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn; Silverman, Steven  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Dear all,

I wanted to check back in on this short capability statement. Quoc, I saw your email that you have no edits (thank you!); others in OGC, if you have any comments please get back to us by noon.

Thanks very much,

Martha

**From:** Simons, Andrew  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 12:05 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Roberts, Martha; Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Thanks. I will include him.

Andrew J. Simons | US EPA | Office of General Counsel | 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW | William Jefferson Clinton Federal Building (WJC), Mail Code 2322A | Washington DC 20460 | phone: (202) 564-3649

The contents of this e-mail and any attachments to it may contain deliberative-process, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you have received this communication in error, please delete the copy you received, and do not print, copy, retransmit, disseminate, or otherwise use the information. Thank you.

**From:** Shouse, Kate

**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 12:04 PM

**To:** Simons, Andrew; Roberts, Martha; Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Hi, Andy. Steve Silverman, who I believe is in ARLO, has reviewed several rulemakings that use SCC. Please let me know if I should reach out to him independently or if you can include him on your message.

Thanks,  
Kate

**From:** Simons, Andrew

**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 12:02 PM

**To:** Roberts, Martha; Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Martha:

I think there are other offices, such as ARLO, that may have a better grounding or understanding of the consequences of not being able to use or reference the SCC Technical document. I will circulate it to them as well.

Andy

Andrew J. Simons | US EPA | Office of General Counsel | 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW | William Jefferson Clinton Federal Building (WJC), Mail Code 2322A | Washington DC 20460 | phone: (202) 564-3649

The contents of this e-mail and any attachments to it may contain deliberative-process, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you have received this communication in error, please delete the copy you received, and do not print, copy, retransmit, disseminate, or otherwise use the information. Thank you.

**From:** Roberts, Martha

**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 11:39 AM

**To:** Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn; Simons, Andrew

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** FW: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

+ Andy

**From:** Roberts, Martha

**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 11:36 AM

**To:** Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** FW: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Dear Marilyn, Quoc, and CarolAnn,

Attached is a “capability statement” on bill language that would prohibit EPA from using or even mentioning the interagency Social Cost of Carbon (SCC) estimates in any regulatory analysis or guidance.

According to OCIR, capability statements are statements given to approps staff as they consider bill language in the omnibus (funding) bill. For instance, if the language says EPA will need to post all pending rules on its website for 30 days prior to being finalized we would write about the

agency's ability to do so (or not) and how it would impact the process.

We would appreciate the review of an appropriate OGC staff member to make sure that our response accurately characterizes how the bill language would limit EPA's rulemaking process. I'm not sure if this review best fits in CCILO or GLO's wheelhouse, but was hoping that one of you would know and be able to identify the best person on your team to take a look. (CarolAnn, I am cc'ing you as Marilyn has her autoresponder on).

If we could get a review by noon Monday (or today if possible ☺), that would be much appreciated.

Thanks very much for your assistance,

Martha

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 11:10 AM  
**To:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Roberts, Martha  
**Cc:** Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Attached is a clean version that reflects Alex's comments plus a few minor typo fixes.

Alex or Martha, do you know who in OGC should look at this?

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301



email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

**From:** Barron, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 10:30 AM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Roberts, Martha  
**Cc:** Shouse, Kate; Marten, Alex; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin  
**Subject:** capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Here are my thoughts. Can we have someone in OGC take a look at this since legal obligations come into the picture?

Joel should review on Monday before it goes to budget folks (mostly as an FYI but he may have thoughts).

(cc'ing Robin so she knows this is in the works).

Alex

**To:** Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]; McGartland, Al[McGartland.Al@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Mon 6/1/2015 4:36:31 PM  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

No. I guess I can look for it in the previous email chain.

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 12:34 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

## Ex 5

**From:** McGartland, Al  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 12:21 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** Re: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Elizabeth, kate and Alex -- what ever you decide i will support. Feel free to send to Martha and Joel without me clearing. Cc me.

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 1, 2015, at 12:18 PM, Roberts, Martha <[Roberts.Martha@epa.gov](mailto:Roberts.Martha@epa.gov)> wrote:

Hi all,

Quoc Nguyen from GLO reviewed the statement and let me know she had no edits; edits from Marilyn Kuray (CCILO) are below. If we want to get this to Joel today, I suggest we incorporate these and press ahead – if Steve Silverman sends anything along later we can incorporate them then.

## Ex 5

Martha

**From:** Kuray, Marilyn  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 8:45 AM  
**To:** Roberts, Martha; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn; Silverman, Steven  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Martha,

There's not much here that is in my area. One question I have is whether your intended audience will know what you mean by "disbenefits." I think the last sentence is very important and perhaps should be moved up to the beginning of the implications section.

I also would suggest adding a bit to that sentence:

## Ex 5

\*\*\*\*\*

Marilyn J. Kuray  
Administrative Law Team Leader

Cross-Cutting Law Office  
US EPA Office of General Counsel  
Tel: (202) 564-3449

7426H WJC North

NOTICE: This communication may contain deliberative, privileged, or other confidential information. Do not release under FOIA without appropriate review. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you have received this communication in error, please delete the copy you received, and do not print, copy, re-transmit, disseminate or otherwise use the information. Thank you.

**From:** Roberts, Martha

**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 8:28 AM

**To:** Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn; Silverman, Steven

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate

**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Dear all,

I wanted to check back in on this short capability statement. Quoc, I saw your email that you have no edits (thank you!); others in OGC, if you have any comments please get back to us by noon.

Thanks very much,

Martha

**From:** Simons, Andrew

**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 12:05 PM

**To:** Shouse, Kate; Roberts, Martha; Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Thanks. I will include him.

Andrew J. Simons | US EPA | Office of General Counsel | 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW | William Jefferson Clinton Federal Building (WJC), Mail Code 2322A | Washington DC 20460 | phone: (202) 564-3649

The contents of this e-mail and any attachments to it may contain deliberative-process, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you have received this communication in error, please delete the copy you received, and do not print, copy, retransmit, disseminate, or otherwise use the information. Thank you.

**From:** Shouse, Kate

**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 12:04 PM

**To:** Simons, Andrew; Roberts, Martha; Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Hi, Andy. Steve Silverman, who I believe is in ARLO, has reviewed several rulemakings that use SCC. Please let me know if I should reach out to him independently or if you can include him on your message.

Thanks,  
Kate

**From:** Simons, Andrew

**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 12:02 PM

**To:** Roberts, Martha; Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn

**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Martha:

I think there are other offices, such as ARLO, that may have a better grounding or understanding of the consequences of not being able to use or reference the SCC Technical document. I will circulate it to them as well.

Andy

Andrew J. Simons | US EPA | Office of General Counsel | 1200 Pennsylvania Ave., NW | William Jefferson Clinton Federal Building (WJC), Mail Code 2322A | Washington DC 20460 | phone: (202) 564-3649

The contents of this e-mail and any attachments to it may contain deliberative-process, attorney-client, attorney work product, or otherwise privileged material. If you are not the intended recipient, or believe you have received this communication in error, please delete the copy you received, and do not print, copy, retransmit, disseminate, or otherwise use the information. Thank you.

**From:** Roberts, Martha  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 11:39 AM  
**To:** Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn; Simons, Andrew  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** FW: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

+ Andy

**From:** Roberts, Martha  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 11:36 AM  
**To:** Kuray, Marilyn; Nguyen, Quoc; Siciliano, CarolAnn  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** FW: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Dear Marilyn, Quoc, and CarolAnn,

Attached is a “capability statement” on bill language that would prohibit EPA from using or even mentioning the interagency Social Cost of Carbon (SCC) estimates in any regulatory analysis or guidance.

According to OCIR, capability statements are statements given to approps staff as they

consider bill language in the omnibus (funding) bill. For instance, if the language says EPA will need to post all pending rules on its website for 30 days prior to being finalized we would write about the agency's ability to do so (or not) and how it would impact the process.

We would appreciate the review of an appropriate OGC staff member to make sure that our response accurately characterizes how the bill language would limit EPA's rulemaking process. I'm not sure if this review best fits in CCILO or GLO's wheelhouse, but was hoping that one of you would know and be able to identify the best person on your team to take a look. (CarolAnn, I am cc'ing you as Marilyn has her autoresponder on).

If we could get a review by noon Monday (or today if possible ☺), that would be much appreciated.

Thanks very much for your assistance,

Martha

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 11:10 AM  
**To:** Barron, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Roberts, Martha  
**Cc:** Shouse, Kate; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin  
**Subject:** RE: capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Attached is a clean version that reflects Alex's comments plus a few minor typo fixes.

Alex or Martha, do you know who in OGC should look at this?

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

**From:** Barron, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 10:30 AM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Roberts, Martha  
**Cc:** Shouse, Kate; Marten, Alex; McGartland, Al; Kime, Robin  
**Subject:** capability statement on SCC (05 28 15).docx

Here are my thoughts. Can we have someone in OGC take a look at this since legal obligations come into the picture?

Joel should review on Monday before it goes to budget folks (mostly as an FYI but he may have thoughts).

(cc'ing Robin so she knows this is in the works).

Alex



**To:** Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Mon 6/1/2015 12:49:54 PM  
**Subject:** RE: EPW QFRs - Due COB 6/3  
QFRs EPW 02-11-15 (CCD) ks\_ek.docx

Hi Kate –

Here is my take on it – see attached.

I don't think we need a sentence on the correction – it is too small, and it is not relevant to the question. Not even sure we even need the entire last paragraph, since that is also not really what the question is about – so perhaps we should flag that for management before it goes out.

Feel free to call me if it is easier to discuss by phone.

Thanks,

Elizabeth

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Friday, May 29, 2015 3:42 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** FW: EPW QFRs - Due COB 6/3

**Ex 5**

I need to send my response by COB Wednesday (6/3), so anything you can send by noon on

Wednesday will be great.

Thanks,  
Kate

**From:** Friedman, Kristina  
**Sent:** Tuesday, May 26, 2015 5:26 PM  
**To:** Sarofim, Marcus; Birnbaum, Rona; Shouse, Kate; Fawcett, Allen; Irving, Bill  
**Cc:** Kocchi, Suzanne  
**Subject:** EPW QFRs - Due COB 6/3

Hi,

We received QFRs from Janet's February EPW hearing on 111(d). Attached please find a subset for CCD review (the list of which is included below). Could you please review/revise the attached responses by COB Wednesday, 6/3? The IO took a shot at drafting responses, but your review is greatly appreciated. Please feel free to pull in others across OAP as necessary (or let me know if they should be reassigned within OAP). I will share our responses, as appropriate, with OAQPS before they are sent forward for OGC review. If you need additional time, please let me know.

Thanks!  
Kristina

Sessions 1 (CSIB/CEB)

Vitter SCC (CEB)

Vitter European (CPB/CEB)

Vitter Science 1-10 (CSIB/CPB)

*Kristina Friedman*

*Office of Atmospheric Programs*

*U.S. Environmental Protection Agency*

*Phone: (202) 343-9281*

**To:** Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Thur 5/28/2015 4:58:00 PM  
**Subject:** RE: updates in oil and gas  
EO 12866 Landfills EG 2060 AS23 NPRM 20150522\_preamblerule\_ek.docx

Hi Kate –

Here's what I have done for the Landfill EG preamble. In the case of landfills, the package may very well go over to OMB with the comment bubbles that flag where numbers still need to be inserted. For O&G we may have time to add the corrected numbers before OMB transmission, but for now I suggest just using this approach.

We have the corrected SCM numbers in 2007\$. We will need to update to 2012\$ for landfills. Not sure what O&G is using.

Alex – when you get a chance, can you send us the full table of corrected estimates – for all years through 2050?

Thanks!

Elizabeth

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 28, 2015 12:41 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Subject:** RE: updates in oil and gas

That would be great, thanks.

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth

**Sent:** Thursday, May 28, 2015 12:33 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** Re: updates in oil and gas

I will send you what I am doing for landfills shortly as I think the treatment should be similar.

Sent from my iPhone

On May 28, 2015, at 12:18 PM, "Shouse, Kate" <[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov](mailto:Shouse.Kate@epa.gov)> wrote:

Hi – The oil and gas preamble is going to OAR's front office today and I'm trying to determine whether it makes sense to add the SCC update now or wait for the next round. Key question for me is whether we think we'll be able to update the numbers before sending to OMB, as that will affect how we present the update. Are the corrected SC-CH4 estimates ready now and if not, do we expect them before end of next week? Also, should I include a placeholder for an erratum (possibly listed as submitted rather than accepted)?

Thanks,  
Kate

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 2:58 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** rulemaking pipeline

SCC plan for rules in pipeline:

**Ex 5**

# Ex 5

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 2:50 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: draft capability statement on SCC

Thanks, Elizabeth, I did receive that statement and the same June 1 deadline. I haven't drafted anything yet and will take a look at what you wrote; will be good to pass the same language forward in OP and OAR. I also received some EPW QFRs, due June 3<sup>rd</sup> that I have not yet opened; will send you the draft (not likely today).

In other SCC news:

# Ex 5

# Ex 5

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 2:34 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex; McGartland, Al; Bowen, Jennifer  
**Subject:** draft capability statement on SCC  
**Importance:** High

Hi Kate (and Alex if you have time) –

Did the request for a capability statement on SCC related to some Senate bill language come over to you too? See below and attached. I have an initial (likely way too long) draft of the statement – also attached. If you have time and want to weigh in, I would welcome any edits/suggestions.

I have to send it to Robin by June 1, but she tells me they will not be released until June 16<sup>th</sup>.

Thanks,

Elizabeth

**From:** Kime, Robin  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 21, 2015 4:15 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al; Simon, Nathalie; Bowen, Jennifer; Snyder, Brett; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Roberts, Martha; Barron, Alex; Teplitzky, Andy; Derkasch, Patricia  
**Subject:** Capability Statements - Due to Robin by 4:00 p.m. 6/4 please  
**Importance:** High

Greetings,

EPA programs are asked to prepare capability statements for programmatic issues. Please see the attached document which is the master list of bill language from the Senate. Additionally, attached is the pdf of the capability statements that assigns programs to language. OCIR asked us to take the lead on the response to two topics:

## **Non-Responsive**

Social Cost of Carbon – Pg 10

Please send me your proposed responses by 4:00 p.m. on June 4.

Thanks

Robin

564-6587

---

Background:

Each year we are asked by the Appropriations committee staff to review proposed Bill and Report language requests they received from Member offices. This goes back to the days of earmarks in which we reviewed the proposed project to see if the Agency was “capable” of awarding this grant under our existing authorities. Since the earmark ban in 2010 we now review only the proposed Bill and Report language sent to the Committee from the Members offices.

Attached is the master list of proposed Bill or Report language from the Senate. We would like you to circulate this to your program areas and have them complete a capability statement for each relevant item. A sample capability statement is also attached. Let me know if there are questions.



**To:** Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Wed 5/27/2015 7:09:07 PM  
**Subject:** RE: draft capability statement on SCC

# Ex 5

## POTENTIAL IMPLICATIONS:

# Ex 5

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 2:58 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: draft capability statement on SCC

OK, sounds good. Re: the capability statement, I just talked it over with Alex M, and am making some more edits to it now. So you may want to hold off till I send you a revised version.

As for the rules – I don't know what to say about NHTSA's EIS, but happy to talk it over with you once you learn more.

The plan for 111d sounds good.

After my conversation with Alex B earlier, I updated my notes on the list of rules in the pipeline – see below. Let me know if you have any additions or concerns about the plan for any of them.

Must run soon but happy to talk more in the morning.

Best,

Elizabeth

SCC plan for rules in pipeline:

**Ex 5**

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 2:50 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: draft capability statement on SCC

Thanks, Elizabeth, I did receive that statement and the same June 1 deadline. I haven't drafted anything yet and will take a look at what you wrote; will be good to pass the same language forward in OP and OAR. I also received some EPW QFRs, due June 3<sup>rd</sup> that I have not yet opened; will send you the draft (not likely today).

In other SCC news:

**Ex 5**

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 2:34 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex; McGartland, Al; Bowen, Jennifer  
**Subject:** draft capability statement on SCC  
**Importance:** High

Hi Kate (and Alex if you have time) –

Did the request for a capability statement on SCC related to some Senate bill language come over to you too? See below and attached. I have an initial (likely way too long) draft of the statement – also attached. If you have time and want to weigh in, I would welcome any edits/suggestions.

I have to send it to Robin by June 1, but she tells me they will not be released until June 16<sup>th</sup>.

Thanks,

Elizabeth

**From:** Kime, Robin

**Sent:** Thursday, May 21, 2015 4:15 PM

**To:** McGartland, Al; Simon, Nathalie; Bowen, Jennifer; Snyder, Brett; Kopits, Elizabeth

**Cc:** Roberts, Martha; Barron, Alex; Teplitzky, Andy; Derkasch, Patricia

**Subject:** Capability Statements - Due to Robin by 4:00 p.m. 6/4 please

**Importance:** High

Greetings,

EPA programs are asked to prepare capability statements for programmatic issues. Please see the attached document which is the master list of bill language from the Senate. Additionally, attached is the pdf of the capability statements that assigns programs to language. OCIR asked us to take the lead on the response to two topics:

**Non-Responsive**

Social Cost of Carbon – Pg 10

Please send me your proposed responses by 4:00 p.m. on June 4.

Thanks

Robin

564-6587

---

Background:

Each year we are asked by the Appropriations committee staff to review proposed Bill and Report language requests they received from Member offices. This goes back to the days of earmarks in which we reviewed the proposed project to see if the Agency was “capable” of awarding this grant under our existing authorities. Since the earmark ban in 2010 we now review only the proposed Bill and Report language sent to the Committee from the Members offices.

Attached is the master list of proposed Bill or Report language from the Senate. We would like you to circulate this to your program areas and have them complete a capability statement for each relevant item. A sample capability statement is also attached. Let me know if there are questions.

---

[1] <http://www.biologicaldiversity.org/swcbd/PROGRAMS/policy/energy/cbd-vs-nhtsa-ruling-11-15-2007.pdf>

[2] <http://www.gao.gov/products/GAO-14-663>

**To:** Kime, Robin[Kime.Robin@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Wed 5/27/2015 4:20:41 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Capability Statements

Very helpful, thanks!

**From:** Kime, Robin  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 12:20 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; McGartland, Al; Simon, Nathalie; Bowen, Jennifer; Snyder, Brett  
**Cc:** Roberts, Martha  
**Subject:** RE: Capability Statements

Hi- the statements will be issued June 16.

Thanks.

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 12:05 PM  
**To:** Kime, Robin; McGartland, Al; Simon, Nathalie; Bowen, Jennifer; Snyder, Brett  
**Cc:** Roberts, Martha  
**Subject:** RE: Capability Statements

Hi Robin,

**Ex 5**

Thanks,

Elizabeth

**From:** Kime, Robin  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 27, 2015 12:02 PM

**To:** McGartland, Al; Simon, Nathalie; Bowen, Jennifer; Snyder, Brett; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Roberts, Martha  
**Subject:** Capability Statements  
**Importance:** High

Hi

The markup moved up on the calendar. Would you be able to send the statements to me by COB on Monday 6/1?

Either way, thanks for considering.

**From:** Kime, Robin  
**Sent:** Thursday, May 21, 2015 4:15 PM  
**To:** McGartland, Al; Simon, Nathalie; Bowen, Jennifer; Snyder, Brett; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Roberts, Martha; Barron, Alex; Teplitzky, Andy; Derkasch, Patricia  
**Subject:** Capability Statements - Due to Robin by 4:00 p.m. 6/4 please  
**Importance:** High

Greetings,

EPA programs are asked to prepare capability statements for programmatic issues. Please see the attached document which is the master list of bill language from the Senate. Additionally, attached is the pdf of the capability statements that assigns programs to language. OCIR asked us to take the lead on the response to two topics:

## Non-Responsive

Social Cost of Carbon – Pg 10

Please send me your proposed responses by 4:00 p.m. on June 4.

Thanks

Robin

564-6587

---

Background:

Each year we are asked by the Appropriations committee staff to review proposed Bill and Report language requests they received from Member offices. This goes back to the days of earmarks in which we reviewed the proposed project to see if the Agency was “capable” of awarding this grant under our existing authorities. Since the earmark ban in 2010 we now review only the proposed Bill and Report language sent to the Committee from the Members offices.

Attached is the master list of proposed Bill or Report language from the Senate. We would like you to circulate this to your program areas and have them complete a capability statement for each relevant item. A sample capability statement is also attached. Let me know if there are questions.



**Cc:** Harvey, Alecia[Harvey.Alecia@epa.gov]  
**To:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; McGartland, Al[McGartland.Al@epa.gov]; Bowen, Jennifer[Bowen.Jennifer@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Fri 5/15/2015 12:52:47 AM  
**Subject:** Re: SOW  
[IA Statement of Work 5 12 2015 clean.docx](#)

Here it is. Thank you so much! Please feel free to call me in the morning if there are any problems.

Personal cell/email

Personal cell/email

Best,  
Elizabeth

---

From: Marten, Alex  
Sent: Thursday, May 14, 2015 6:36 PM  
To: McGartland, Al; Kopits, Elizabeth; Bowen, Jennifer  
Cc: Harvey, Alecia  
Subject: RE: SOW

## Ex 5

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

-----Original Message-----

From: McGartland, Al  
Sent: Thursday, May 14, 2015 4:18 PM  
To: Marten, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth; Bowen, Jennifer  
Cc: Harvey, Alecia  
Subject: FW: SOW

Is there anyway to get this completed by tomorrow so I can sign it from my office?

-----Original Message-----

From: Liem, Lucille  
Sent: Thursday, May 14, 2015 3:56 PM  
To: Feldman, Richard; McGartland, Al  
Cc: Harvey, Alecia  
Subject: RE: SOW

I reviewed the SOW and the Clean Air Act §103(b)(2) is the appropriate statutory authority for this IA.

-----Original Message-----

From: Feldman, Richard  
Sent: Thursday, May 14, 2015 3:23 PM  
To: McGartland, Al  
Cc: Harvey, Alecia; Liem, Lucille  
Subject: FW: SOW  
Importance: High

Al,

Lucille Liem will be looking at this SOW; I left her a voice mail to please expedite. Her number is 202-564-5699

Richard Feldman  
Assistant General Counsel and Claims Officer Civil Rights and Finance Law Office Office of General Counsel U.S. EPA  
(o) 202-564-5434 (f) 202-564-5432

-----Original Message-----

From: Feldman, Richard  
Sent: Wednesday, May 13, 2015 9:33 AM  
To: Liem, Lucille  
Subject: FW: SOW  
Importance: High

Lucille

Please handle this. Thanks

Richard Feldman  
Assistant General Counsel and Claims Officer Civil Rights and Finance Law Office Office of General Counsel U.S. EPA  
(o) 202-564-5434 (f) 202-564-5432

-----Original Message-----

From: Harvey, Alecia  
Sent: Wednesday, May 13, 2015 9:01 AM  
To: Feldman, Richard  
Cc: Smith, Leon; Liem, Lucille  
Subject: FW: SOW  
Importance: High

Please review this. The Clean Air Act is being used. Is this an appropriate SOW for this?

Please review this. The Clean Air Act is being used. I want to make sure this is appropriate. Thanks

**To:** Irving, Verna[Irving.Verna@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Kime, Robin[Kime.Robin@epa.gov]  
**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tue 1/13/2015 2:35:44 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Control: AL-14-001-004

Hi Verna and Robin,

Is there any update on this? Has the Warner response been sent?

Thanks,

Elizabeth

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 08, 2015 11:13 AM  
**To:** Irving, Verna  
**Cc:** Kime, Robin  
**Subject:** FW: Control: AL-14-001-004

Hi Verna,

Per our conversation, here is the last version of the response letter that I have. You may want to cross check against what you have to make sure no other edits were made after this point. Feel free to call if there is anything else I can do to help.

Also, can you please let me know once it is sent and forward me the final signed copy for my records? I am due to go on maternity leave soon, and I would like to be able to leave the final version for others in my office in case anyone should need to look back at it while I'm on out.

Thanks!

Elizabeth

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 11, 2014 3:18 PM  
**To:** Poole, Jacqueline; Kime, Robin  
**Subject:** RE: Control: AL-14-001-004

Here is a clean version. Tracked changes have been turned off. The OCIR contact info still needs to be added in the highlight spots.

Hope this helps,

Elizabeth

**From:** Poole, Jacqueline  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 11, 2014 3:15 PM  
**To:** Kime, Robin  
**Cc:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Subject:** FW: Control: AL-14-001-004

Hi Robin,

There is something in the track changes that will not take on the memo. I need someone to release the track so I can edit. Thanks!

**From:** Kime, Robin  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 11, 2014 2:54 PM  
**To:** Poole, Jacqueline  
**Subject:** Control: AL-14-001-004

Hi,

Attached is a Word file containing a response to the attached control (CMS tracking sheet is also attached) for AL-14-001-004. Would you please format the response memo and package it in hard copy for Joel to sign? Please include a routing slip to be signed by Alex Barron and Joel. Thank you.

**From:** Barron, Alex

**Sent:** Thursday, December 11, 2014 10:59 AM

**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Kime, Robin

**Cc:** McGartland, Al; Marten, Alex; Li, Jia; Shouse, Kate; Poole, Jacqueline

**Subject:** Warner response 12 10 14 ab.docx

A few minor tweaks. Robin – Will this go through OMB after Joel's signature since it involves SCC? If not, Elizabeth, can you just let laity and Josh know that we are doing this response and flag the very limited text that was not in the Vitter letter?

Otherwise looks good to go. Sorry it took me so long to get to this. The postTurkey period has been crazy and my cold hasn't helped.

Alex

**From:** Linn, Joshua  
**Location:** EEOB 359 (Bradford Conference Room)  
**Importance:** Normal  
**Subject:** FW: SCC Interagency Working Group Meeting Feb 6, 11am-12pm, EEOB 359  
**Start Date/Time:** Fri 2/6/2015 4:00:00 PM  
**End Date/Time:** Fri 2/6/2015 5:00:00 PM

# Ex 5

-----Original Appointment-----

**From:** Linn, Joshua [mailto:[EOP email/phone](#)]  
**Sent:** Thursday, January 29, 2015 7:11 PM  
**To:** Linn, Joshua; Marten, Alex; Sarofim, Marcus; Mignone, Bryan; [pduffy@usgcrp.gov](mailto:pduffy@usgcrp.gov); Schwab, Margo; Kopits, Elizabeth; Wolverton, Ann; Newbold, Steve; Li, Jia; Shouse, Kate; Johansson, Robert - OCE; Thomas, Amanda; Griffiths, Charles; [Elke.Hodson@hq.doe.gov](mailto:Elke.Hodson@hq.doe.gov); [Arthur.Rypinski@dot.gov](mailto:Arthur.Rypinski@dot.gov); Mancini, Dominic J.; Duke, Rick; [Bruce D Rodan](#) [EOP email/phone]  
Holdren, John P.; Utech, Dan G.; McConville, Drew; McGartland, Al; Barron, Alex; Gunning, Paul; [SHelper@doc.gov](mailto:SHelper@doc.gov); [PFeather@oce.usda.gov](mailto:PFeather@oce.usda.gov); [William.Hohenstein@usda.gov](mailto:William.Hohenstein@usda.gov); [james\\_anderson@ios.doi.gov](mailto:james_anderson@ios.doi.gov); [aevia@blm.gov](mailto:aevia@blm.gov); Simon, Bob; Jencks, Fae; Higgins, Cortney; [jonathan.pershing@hq.doe.gov](mailto:jonathan.pershing@hq.doe.gov); Laity, Jim; Obstfeld, Maurice; Shelanski, Howard; Goldstein, Jeff; Himel, Sam  
**Subject:** SCC Interagency Working Group Meeting Feb 6, 11am-12pm, EEOB 359  
**When:** Friday, February 06, 2015 11:00 AM-12:00 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).  
**Where:** EEOB 359 (Bradford Conference Room)

Dear members of the SCC Interagency Working Group:

We will have a meeting for all working group members from **11am-12pm** on **February 6**, in **EEOB 359** (the Bradford Conference Room, enter through the CEA main office). There will be two major topics on the agenda:

# Ex 5

# Ex 5

Finally, please submit WAVES requests to Jeff Goldstein ([REDACTED] **EOP email/phone** [REDACTED])

Best,

Jim Laity and Josh Linn

**To:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Adamantiades, Mikhail[Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov];  
Eschmann, Erich[Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Lamson, Amy[Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]  
**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Tue 7/21/2015 3:05:23 PM  
**Subject:** RE: EPRI comments on costs and ben in CPP  
[EPRI comments 8.7.2 \(8\).docx](#)

Thanks, all, for the helpful and fast response. I've updated the response to reflect your comments and attached it: please let me know if you see anything amiss.

Non-Responsive

**Non-Responsive**

**Non-Responsive**

Thanks,  
Kate

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Monday, July 20, 2015 2:18 PM  
**To:** Adamantiades, Mikhail; Shouse, Kate; Eschmann, Erich  
**Subject:** RE: EPRI comments on costs and ben in CPP

**Ex 5**

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: [\(202\) 566-2301](tel:2025662301)



email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

**From:** Adamantiades, Mikhail  
**Sent:** Monday, July 20, 2015 2:10 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate; Eschmann, Erich  
**Subject:** RE: EPRI comments on costs and ben in CPP

# Non-Responsive

## Ex 5

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Monday, July 20, 2015 1:05 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Eschmann, Erich; Adamantiades, Mikhail  
**Subject:** Re: EPRI comments on costs and ben in CPP

A few thoughts based on EPRI's four points

# Non-Responsive

## Non-Responsive

Non-Responsive

**Ex 5**

--  
Alex Marten

[marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

---

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Sunday, July 19, 2015 3:30 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex; Eschmann, Erich; Adamantiades, Mikhail  
**Subject:** Fwd: EPRI comments on costs and ben in CPP

**Non-Responsive**

**Ex 5**

# Ex 5

## EPRI comment:

One comment stated that there are inconsistencies in the RIA's cost-benefit comparisons of estimated CO2 benefits and compliance costs and recommended that EPA correct them for proper comparison of benefits and costs:

- "The RIA compares levelized (or annualized) compliance costs to annual CO2 benefits. This is an inconsistent comparison with no practical meaning. The proper comparison is a comparison of the net present value streams of fixed and variable compliance costs and estimated benefits (both for CO2 and air pollution reductions)."
- "The proposed rule's base case is inconsistent with the socioeconomic/emissions scenarios used in the SCC calculations. Specifically, the U.S. CO2 emissions, energy system, and economic condition underlying the estimated CO2 reductions and compliance costs are inconsistent with the socioeconomic and emissions futures underlying the USG SCC estimates used to value the proposed rules CO2 reduction benefits. The SCC estimates are computed using five alternative global socioeconomic and GHG emissions futures designed to span a range of possible global futures, with each future considered equally likely. Compliance costs and CO2 reductions in the RIA, on the other hand, assume a single, U.S. power sector projection (based on the AEO 2013 Reference Case). This is an issue because the underlying USG modeling shows that SCC values vary across socioeconomic and emissions assumptions (USG, 2014). Therefore, one would want the same reference case assumptions for the SCC, CO2 reductions, and compliance costs, or an argument for why it is unnecessary."
- The commenter found that when comparing the USG SCC and AEO2013 Reference Case socioeconomic and emissions projections, "the AEO2013 projections do not compare well with any of the USG SCC input scenarios, with lower projected U.S. energy sector CO2 emissions and higher GDP that are based on much lower assumptions regarding the emissions and energy intensity of output (CO2/GDP and Btu/GDP respectively)".
- The commenter also stated that "USG SCC technical documentation recommends using all four of the USG time profiles of SCC values. The four have meaningful differences in discounting and what they represent probabilistically. However, there is no USG guidance on how agencies should apply the different SCC values jointly and consistently in rulemaking."

**To:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]  
**From:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Sent:** Fri 7/17/2015 9:56:20 PM  
**Subject:** RE: RIA  
EO12866 CPP 2060 AR33 RIA Final 20150717.docx

Here's a copy for Management.

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, July 17, 2015 5:52 PM  
**To:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA  
**Subject:** Re: RIA

Could you send the single file version. Management asked for a copy in case they have time over the weekend and not sure if I'll see the uploaded version to forward them. Thanks.

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

On Jul 17, 2015, at 5:49 PM, Macpherson, Alex <[Macpherson.Alex@epa.gov](mailto:Macpherson.Alex@epa.gov)> wrote:

Cool. Thanks. And thanks for all your help...really.

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Friday, July 17, 2015 5:48 PM  
**To:** Macpherson, Alex; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: RIA

No, we aren't waiting. We've already cleared its path in that we said we thought it was good to go.

d

**From:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, July 17, 2015 5:47 PM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RIA

**Non-Responsive**

**To:** Rennert, Kevin[Rennert.Kevin@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Fri 7/17/2015 4:45:18 PM  
**Subject:** RE: 111d RIA upload  
[ch3a\\_upstream\\_methane.docx](#)  
[ch4\\_benefits.docx](#)  
[ch4a\\_benefits\\_appendix.docx](#)  
[ch5\\_secondary\\_econ\\_impacts.docx](#)  
[ch6\\_employment.docx](#)  
[ch6a\\_employment\\_appendix.docx](#)  
[ch7\\_exec\\_orders.docx](#)  
[ch8\\_net\\_benefits.docx](#)  
[ch0\\_exec\\_summ.docx](#)  
[ch1\\_intro.docx](#)  
[ch2\\_profile.docx](#)  
[ch3\\_cost\\_emissions.docx](#)

Hi Kevin,

Attached is the current working version of the RIA. It may undergo a few more tweaks before it gets sent today, but those tweaks will be very small.

**Non-Responsive**

**Non-Responsive**

Please let us know if you have any questions,

Dave

**From:** Rennert, Kevin  
**Sent:** Friday, July 17, 2015 11:28 AM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: 111d RIA upload

That sounds quite sensible. Thanks, Dave. -Kevin

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Friday, July 17, 2015 11:27 AM  
**To:** Rennert, Kevin; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: 111d RIA upload

Kevin,

**Non-Responsive**

Dave

**From:** Rennert, Kevin  
**Sent:** Friday, July 17, 2015 11:26 AM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** 111d RIA upload

Dave and Alex – do you have a copy of the latest RIA for 111d that is (allegedly) on track for upload today? I'd love to take a read through to get up to speed.

Thanks,

Kevin



**To:** Evans, DavidA[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Deck, Leland[Deck.Leland@epa.gov]; Risley, David[Risley.David@epa.gov]; Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marks, Matthew[Marks.Matthew@epa.gov]; Hoffman, Howard[hoffman.howard@epa.gov]; CurryBrown, Amanda[CurryBrown.amanda@epa.gov]; Elman, Barry[Elman.Barry@epa.gov]; Roberts, Martha[Roberts.Martha@epa.gov]; Hutson, Nick[Hutson.Nick@epa.gov]; Fellner, Christian[Fellner.Christian@epa.gov]  
**From:** Silverman, Steven  
**Sent:** Mon 7/13/2015 1:52:23 PM  
**Subject:** RE: 111 b RIA

Thanks for setting me straight on table 4-5

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Sunday, July 12, 2015 8:20 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex; Deck, Leland; Risley, David; Shouse, Kate  
**Cc:** Marks, Matthew; Hoffman, Howard; Silverman, Steven; CurryBrown, Amanda; Elman, Barry; Roberts, Martha; Hutson, Nick; Fellner, Christian  
**Subject:** RE: 111 b RIA

Thanks for looking at it, Steve!

Leland, Alex, David, Kate FYI. (Hope you don't mind me circulating sooner than later, Amanda!) David, Kate, and Alex there are edits to 3, including the SCC discussion.

Barry, Alex or I will send you the tables around page 5-20 (if you don't have access). I suspect

**Non-Responsive**

Amanda, lets talk about

**Non-Responsive**

**Non-Responsive**

# Non-Responsive

Also, I like all of the bolding of your edits. Makes them pop.

d

**From:** Silverman, Steven  
**Sent:** Sunday, July 12, 2015 4:21 PM  
**To:** CurryBrown, Amanda; Evans, DavidA; Elman, Barry; Roberts, Martha; Hutson, Nick; Fellner, Christian  
**Cc:** Marks, Matthew; Hoffman, Howard  
**Subject:** 111 b RIA

I have been thru RIA and put cmmts into the sharepoint version (should show up in bold). Nick, please check text at n 44 and p 4-22 to update to reflect latest NETL.

Please check table 4-5, which looks funky (and doesn't appear to use \$ KWh for LCOE)

Check discussion of **Non-Responsive**

I did not look at ch 6 (NGCC)

Barry/Martha, material at p 5-20 might be of help on **Non-Responsive**



However, please give a glance.

**To:** Beauvais, Joel[Beauvais.Joel@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Evans, DavidA[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Rees, Sarah[Rees.Sarah@epa.gov]  
**From:** Elman, Barry  
**Sent:** Fri 7/10/2015 10:18:41 PM  
**Subject:** FW: FUpdated version of 111(b) New/Mod/Recon preamble and Reg Text  
[EO 12866+111\(b\) New-Mods 07102015 clean draft final.docx](#)  
[111b preamble 07102015 RLSO compare 05052015.docx](#)  
[GHG EGU 111\(b\) Reg Text 07102015 DRAFT.docx](#)  
[Summary of Interagency Comments 111\(b\) New-Mods\\_Final EPAResponse.docx](#)

FYI – See below and attached.

**From:** Hutson, Nick  
**Sent:** Friday, July 10, 2015 5:56 PM  
**To:** Culligan, Kevin; Fruh, Steve; Fellner, Christian; Johnson, Mary; Marsh, Karen; DeFigueiredo, Mark; Karimjee, Anhar; Svendsgaard, Dave; Herring, Jeff; Hoffman, Howard; Silverman, Steven; Jordan, Scott; Marks, Matthew; Elman, Barry; Roberts, Martha; Boswell, Colin; CurryBrown, Amanda; Hackel, Angela; Vasu, Amy; Ashley, Jackie  
**Subject:** FUpdated version of 111(b) New/Mod/Recon preamble and Reg Text

All -

The attached files have been transmitted to OMB for additional review:

1. A clean version of the DRAFT final 111(b) standards for new, modified, and reconstructed fossil fuel-fired EGUs
2. A RLSO version that shows changes to the version that was previously submitted (note: formatting changes are not shown)
3. A clean version of the accompanying rule language
4. EPA Response to Interagency Comments

Note ... the files on SharePoint are still the Master copies. Please continue to make edits/comments/etc. on those versions.

Have a nice weekend.

Nick

**Nick Hutson, PhD**

Energy Strategies Group

Office of Air & Radiation

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

tel: +1 919 541 2968

email: [hutson.nick@epa.gov](mailto:hutson.nick@epa.gov)

**To:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Tue 6/30/2015 7:22:01 PM  
**Subject:** RE: RIA presentation outline  
2015 06 30 notes on RIA draft - alm dae.docx

I accepted your comments and made some edits per our convo.

d

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 30, 2015 1:01 PM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA  
**Subject:** RE: RIA presentation outline

I did not include anything Non-Responsive FYI

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 30, 2015 12:50 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: RIA presentation outline

Also, flag Non-Responsive I think for the purposes of the RIA we should note that they are cross-referenced.

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 30, 2015 12:42 PM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA  
**Subject:** RE: RIA presentation outline

good point. i am going to pass back momentarily

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 30, 2015 12:41 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: RIA presentation outline

We need to include 

<b>Non-Responsive</b>
-----------------------

 not yet included.

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 30, 2015 12:07 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: RIA presentation outline

Here is draft 1 pager. Once we get information on the page, I think we will want to format it to make it less dense.

Dave

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 30, 2015 10:32 AM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA  
**Subject:** RE: RIA presentation outline

How do you want to split this up?

Impacts table attached

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 30, 2015 9:58 AM  
**To:** Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RIA presentation outline

Alex,

From our brainstorm yesterday:



**Non-Responsive**

**To:** Deck, Leland[Deck.Leland@epa.gov]; Kaufman, Kathy[Kaufman.Kathy@epa.gov]; Walton, Tom[Walton.Tom@epa.gov]; Langdon, Robin[Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]; Risley, David[Risley.David@epa.gov]; Chappell, Linda[Chappell.Linda@epa.gov]; Ferris, Ann[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov]; Evans, DavidA[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]; Alsalam, Jameel[Alsalam.Jameel@epa.gov]; Bryson, Joe[Bryson.Joe@epa.gov]; Eschmann, Erich[Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov]; Hubbell, Bryan[Hubbell.Bryan@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl[Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Conlin, Beth[Conlin.Beth@epa.gov]; Schreifels, Jeremy[Schreifels.Jeremy@epa.gov]; Keaveny, Brian[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov]; Li, Jia[Li.Jia@epa.gov]; Adamantiades, Mikhail[Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov]; CurryBrown, Amanda[CurryBrown.amanda@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy[Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Harvey, Reid[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov]; Stenhouse, Jeb[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov]; Culligan, Kevin[Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov]  
**From:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Sent:** Fri 6/26/2015 8:14:25 PM  
**Subject:** FW: CPP RIA to OMB  
[EO12866 CPP 2060 AR33 RIA Final 20150626.docx](#)

Hi Team

Attached is the RIA draft that is going forward to OMB today. Thanks you so much for your great and hard work over the last few days and weeks.

I've stored this version in its own directory on our team site. The chapters feeding this draft are still in the same directory and will continue to serve as the live draft moving forward. In those version, I retained all the comments pointing at issues we still need to visit or places that need filled in once results are available.

Let me know if you have any questions. Again, thanks for all your work and have a great weekend  
Alex

**From:** Eck, Janet  
**Sent:** Friday, June 26, 2015 3:20 PM  
**To:** Rush, Alan  
**Cc:** Henigin, Mary; Vasu, Amy; Culligan, Kevin; Fruh, Steve; Thompson, Fred; Hutson, Nick; Fellner, Christian; Jones, Toni; Boswell, Colin; Johnson, Mary; Macpherson, Alex; Weatherhead, Darryl; CurryBrown, Amanda; Keaveny, Brian  
**Subject:** CPP RIA

**To:** Deck, Leland[Deck.Leland@epa.gov]; Kaufman, Kathy[Kaufman.Kathy@epa.gov]; Walton, Tom[Walton.Tom@epa.gov]; Langdon, Robin[Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]; Risley, David[Risley.David@epa.gov]; Chappell, Linda[Chappell.Linda@epa.gov]; Ferris, Ann[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov]; Evans, DavidA[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]; Alsalam, Jameel[Alsalam.Jameel@epa.gov]; Bryson, Joe[Bryson.Joe@epa.gov]; Eschmann, Erich[Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov]; Hubbell, Bryan[Hubbell.Bryan@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl[Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Conlin, Beth[Conlin.Beth@epa.gov]; Schreifels, Jeremy[Schreifels.Jeremy@epa.gov]; Keaveny, Brian[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov]; Li, Jia[Li.Jia@epa.gov]; Adamantiades, Mikhail[Adamantiades.Mikhail@epa.gov]; CurryBrown, Amanda[CurryBrown.amanda@epa.gov]; Lamson, Amy[Lamson.Amy@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Harvey, Reid[Harvey.Reid@epa.gov]; Stenhouse, Jeb[Stenhouse.Jeb@epa.gov]; Culligan, Kevin[Culligan.Kevin@epa.gov]  
**From:** Macpherson, Alex  
**Sent:** Fri 6/26/2015 8:14:25 PM  
**Subject:** FW: CPP RIA to OMB  
[EO12866 CPP 2060 AR33 RIA Final 20150626.docx](#)

Hi Team

Attached is the RIA draft that is going forward to OMB today. Thanks you so much for your great and hard work over the last few days and weeks.

I've stored this version in its own directory on our team site. The chapters feeding this draft are still in the same directory and will continue to serve as the live draft moving forward. In those version, I retained all the comments pointing at issues we still need to visit or places that need filled in once results are available.

Let me know if you have any questions. Again, thanks for all your work and have a great weekend  
Alex

**From:** Eck, Janet  
**Sent:** Friday, June 26, 2015 3:20 PM  
**To:** Rush, Alan  
**Cc:** Henigin, Mary; Vasu, Amy; Culligan, Kevin; Fruh, Steve; Thompson, Fred; Hutson, Nick; Fellner, Christian; Jones, Toni; Boswell, Colin; Johnson, Mary; Macpherson, Alex; Weatherhead, Darryl; CurryBrown, Amanda; Keaveny, Brian  
**Subject:** CPP RIA

Hi Alan, Attached are the RIA and RIA spreadsheet for the Clean Power Plan Final Rule (SAN 5548.1). Please forward to OP for upload to ROCIS. Thanks.

**To:** McGartland, Al[McGartland.Al@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Evans, DavidA  
**Sent:** Fri 6/26/2015 1:03:32 PM  
**Subject:** FW: Request -- in prep for OMB briefing tomorrow  
[Analysis of the CPP for OMB 6-26-15.pptx](#)

Here is the slide deck.

**From:** Adamantiades, Mikhail  
**Sent:** Thursday, June 25, 2015 2:41 PM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA; Marten, Alex  
**Cc:** Stenhouse, Jeb  
**Subject:** FW: Request -- in prep for OMB briefing tomorrow

**From:** Adamantiades, Mikhail  
**Sent:** Thursday, June 25, 2015 2:41 PM  
**To:** Vasu, Amy  
**Cc:** Harvey, Reid; Culligan, Kevin; Weatherhead, Darryl; Stenhouse, Jeb  
**Subject:** RE: Request -- in prep for OMB briefing tomorrow

Here it is, everyone has signed off so this is the version we will be using.

**From:** Vasu, Amy  
**Sent:** Thursday, June 25, 2015 12:31 PM  
**To:** Adamantiades, Mikhail  
**Cc:** Harvey, Reid; Culligan, Kevin; Weatherhead, Darryl; Stenhouse, Jeb  
**Subject:** Request -- in prep for OMB briefing tomorrow

Hi, Misha,

Will you please send Kevin, Darryl, and me your presentation when you have a draft ready so that Kevin and Darryl and her group can review the materials?

Later today, once everyone has completed review and the materials have been approved, will you please send them to me to send to OMB?

Thank you.

Amy

~~~~~

*Amy B. Vasu*

*U.S. EPA / OAQPS*

*Sector Policies and Programs Division*

*email: [vasu.amy@epa.gov](mailto:vasu.amy@epa.gov)*

*phone: 919.541.0107*

**To:** Evans, DavidA[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Roberts, Martha  
**Sent:** Wed 6/24/2015 5:54:52 PM  
**Subject:** FW: 111(d) preamble files for Janet and Joe  
[Sections VI and VII EO 12866 CPP 2060 AR33 Final 20150619.docx](#)  
[For note to Janet and Joe.docx](#)  
[Section I EO 12866 CPP 2060 AR33 Final 20150529 061815 11pm.docx](#)  
[Section II EO 12866 CPP 2060 AR33 Final 20150619.docx](#)  
[Section IX Community Considerations June.18.2015.docx](#)  
[Section VIII EO 12866 CPP 2060 AR33 Final 20150619.docx](#)

You asked for it...

**From:** Barron, Alex  
**Sent:** Friday, June 19, 2015 3:02 PM  
**To:** Evans, DavidA; Elman, Barry; Marten, Alex; Roberts, Martha  
**Cc:** Rees, Sarah; Kime, Robin  
**Subject:** FW: 111(d) preamble files for Janet and Joe

Have fun reading!

A

**From:** Culligan, Kevin  
**Sent:** Friday, June 19, 2015 3:00 PM  
**To:** Roberts, Martha  
**Cc:** Barron, Alex  
**Subject:** FW: 111(d) preamble files for Janet and Joe

Will have one more section (executive summary), by 4:15.

**From:** King, Melanie  
**Sent:** Friday, June 19, 2015 2:51 PM  
**To:** Culligan, Kevin  
**Cc:** Vasu, Amy

**Subject:** 111(d) preamble files for Janet and Joe

Hi Kevin,

Here are the files for sections I-II and VI-IX. Also attached is the draft note to Janet and Joe that Amy prepared. I removed the reference to section V.B from the note since we aren't sending that section.



**To:** Macpherson, Alex[Macpherson.Alex@epa.gov]; Deck, Leland[Deck.Leland@epa.gov]; Kaufman, Kathy[Kaufman.Kathy@epa.gov]; Walton, Tom[Walton.Tom@epa.gov]; Langdon, Robin[Langdon.Robin@epa.gov]; Risley, David[Risley.David@epa.gov]; Chappell, Linda[Chappell.Linda@epa.gov]; Ferris, Ann[Ferris.Ann@epa.gov]; Evans, DavidA[Evans.DavidA@epa.gov]; Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]; Shouse, Kate[Shouse.Kate@epa.gov]; Alsalam, Jameel[Alsalam.Jameel@epa.gov]; Bryson, Joe[Bryson.Joe@epa.gov]; Hubbell, Bryan[Hubbell.Bryan@epa.gov]; Weatherhead, Darryl[Weatherhead.Darryl@epa.gov]; Conlin, Beth[Conlin.Beth@epa.gov]; Schreifels, Jeremy[Schreifels.Jeremy@epa.gov]; Keaveny, Brian[Keaveny.Brian@epa.gov]; Li, Jia[Li.Jia@epa.gov]; CurryBrown, Amanda[CurryBrown.amanda@epa.gov]; Eschmann, Erich[Eschmann.Erich@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Sims, Ryan[Sims.Ryan@epa.gov]; Meroney, William[Meroney.William@epa.gov]  
**From:** Adamantiades, Mikhail  
**Sent:** Wed 6/24/2015 2:48:29 PM  
**Subject:** RE: Weekly CPP 111d RIA Team "Huddle"  
[RIA Impact Summary for Janet 6-24-15.docx](#)

On addition to the agenda....

-----Original Appointment-----

**From:** Macpherson, Alex

**Sent:** Tuesday, April 14, 2015 9:24 AM

**To:** Macpherson, Alex; Deck, Leland; Kaufman, Kathy; Walton, Tom; Langdon, Robin; Risley, David; Chappell, Linda; Ferris, Ann; Evans, DavidA; Marten, Alex; Shouse, Kate; Alsalam, Jameel; Bryson, Joe; RTP-OAQPS-919-541-4427-HEID/Phone-Line/RTP-OAQPS-BLDG-C; Hubbell, Bryan; Weatherhead, Darryl; Conlin, Beth; Schreifels, Jeremy; Keaveny, Brian; Li, Jia; Adamantiades, Mikhail; CurryBrown, Amanda

**Cc:** Sims, Ryan; Meroney, William

**Subject:** Weekly CPP 111d RIA Team "Huddle"

**When:** Wednesday, June 24, 2015 11:15 AM-12:00 PM (UTC-05:00) Eastern Time (US & Canada).

**Where:** Conference code

The objective of the now weekly 'huddle' will be to update RIA team members on the 111d schedule, issues, the availability of impacts results, and RIA, Preamble, and RTC writing plans and activities.

#### STANDING AGENDA

Non-Responsive

**To:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Sarofim, Marcus[Sarofim.Marcus@epa.gov]  
**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Wed 6/17/2015 4:52:35 PM  
**Subject:** RE: 111(b) interagency RIA comments re: climate  
[RIA 111\(b\) OMB comments \(bulleted list\).docx](#)  
[RIA 111\(b\) OMB comments \(in line text edits\).docx](#)

Thanks, Alex, this is really helpful.

Marcus, please find attached a copy of the 111(b) RIA that has OMB comments (“RIA 111(b) OMB comments (in line text edits)”). They sent a separate file with comments listed in bullet form; there was only one comment in that file for your section and I’ve carried it over to the full RIA (“RIA 111(b) OMB comments (bulleted list)”). This is the comment that Alex is referring to below.

I don’t remember if you have access to the Sharepoint version but feel free to edit the RIA attached and I can carry it over with the SCC edits.

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Wednesday, June 17, 2015 12:03 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Sarofim, Marcus  
**Cc:** CurryBrown, Amanda; Evans, DavidA  
**Subject:** 111(b) interagency RIA comments re: climate

**Non-Responsive**

# Non-Responsive

# Ex 5

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

**To:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Wed 6/17/2015 12:13:49 PM  
**Subject:** RE: OAR website

Thanks, Alex. And sorry, I could have checked the website myself but was rushing to get out the door.

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 16, 2015 4:38 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Sarofim, Marcus  
**Subject:** RE: OAR website

This was not an NCEE working paper, but I will look into our options.

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: [marten.alex@epa.gov](mailto:marten.alex@epa.gov)

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 16, 2015 4:25 PM  
**To:** Marten, Alex; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Cc:** Sarofim, Marcus  
**Subject:** RE: OAR website

+Marcus (see note below about open access and posting papers like CH4-O3 on the EPA website).

Alex, do you think we could post an author-formatted version? I think this was an option for the Climatic Change IAM special issue, maybe we could do the same with Marten et al. Or did this start out as an NCEE working paper (that's posted on the OP site?)?

**From:** Marten, Alex  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 16, 2015 4:11 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Subject:** RE: OAR website

In retrospect we probably should have paid for the open access option on the article for the reason I think you are eluding to. Maybe something Marcus want to keep in mind for CH4-03...

--

Alex L. Marten  
phone: (202) 566-2301  
email: marten.alex@epa.gov

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 16, 2015 4:09 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** OAR website

Thanks and no problem on the memo, you're not slowing me down on anything.

Another item that will need to be updated is the OAR SCC website. I shared some edits last

**Ex 5**

Please let me know if you'd like to review the attached; they both reference the NAS process (language from the desk statement). The attached file, "website SCC Fact Sheet..." gets

converted to a PDF that is downloaded from the OAR SCC website. The attached file, "website update CO2 updates (06 16 15)" is the language on the OAR SCC website.

Thanks,  
Kate

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 16, 2015 3:49 PM  
**To:** Shouse, Kate; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: footnote for HD2

I think this looks good, and I am fine with the first placement for the first footnote. I also forwarded this to our management. Not sure when they will look at it but will let you know if they have any comments.

Sorry I haven't gotten you comments on the memo yet. I have to leave soon but promise to finish it first thing in the morning.

Thanks,  
Elizabeth

**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 16, 2015 2:18 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** footnote for HD2

Hi – I've created a file with the latest SCC section from the HD2 preamble and added two redline footnotes flagging the TSD correction. The first footnote is in the SC-CO2 section and the second is in the non-CO2 section. Please let me know what you think and I'll circle back with OTAQ to discuss logistics of working this into the final package.

Thanks,  
Kate

**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth[Kopits.Elizabeth@epa.gov]  
**Cc:** Marten, Alex[Marten.Alex@epa.gov]  
**From:** Shouse, Kate  
**Sent:** Tue 6/2/2015 3:58:00 PM  
**Subject:** 95th %tile text

**Ex 5**

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 02, 2015 11:32 AM  
**To:** Marsh, Karen; Vetter, Rick; Thundiyil, Karen  
**Cc:** Ward, Hillary; Cozzie, David; Fulcher, Charles; Shouse, Kate; Moore, Chris; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: Landfills supplemental NSPS - SC-CH4 insert

Hi Karen et al.

My apologies yet again, but as I am reviewing the RIA (still the advance copy I believe), I noticed a few things that would be good to update in the NSPS FRN to improve consistency across documents. Attached is the supplemental FRN plus the benefits insert from yesterday with a few more edits on each.

I hope this helps. Please let me know if you would like to discuss.

Thanks!

Elizabeth



**From:** Marsh, Karen  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 4:25 PM  
**To:** Kopits, Elizabeth; Vetter, Rick; Thundiyil, Karen  
**Cc:** Ward, Hillary; Cozzie, David; Fulcher, Charles; Shouse, Kate; Moore, Chris; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: Landfills supplemental NSPS - SC-CH4 insert

Thanks Elizabeth. I'll get these changes incorporated.

\*\*\*\*\*

Karen R. Marsh, PE

US EPA, OAQPS, Sectors Policies and Programs Division

Fuels and Incineration Group

109 TW Alexander Drive, Mail Code E143-05

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

Direct: (919) 541-1065; email: [marsh.karen@epa.gov](mailto:marsh.karen@epa.gov)

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth  
**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 3:36 PM  
**To:** Marsh, Karen; Vetter, Rick; Thundiyil, Karen  
**Cc:** Ward, Hillary; Cozzie, David; Fulcher, Charles; Shouse, Kate; Moore, Chris; Marten, Alex  
**Subject:** RE: Landfills supplemental NSPS - SC-CH4 insert

Hi Karen et al.,

Sorry for the multiple emails, but here is an update to the file I just sent you. It includes two more minor edits from Alex M.

Thanks!

Elizabeth

**From:** Kopits, Elizabeth

**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 3:06 PM

**To:** Marsh, Karen; Vetter, Rick; Thundiyil, Karen

**Cc:** Ward, Hillary; Cozzie, David; Fulcher, Charles; Shouse, Kate; Moore, Chris; Marten, Alex

**Subject:** RE: Landfills supplemental NSPS - SC-CH4 insert

Hi Karen et al.,

I think this is a good length for the supplemental. Attached are some suggested edits that hopefully do not make it too much longer!

Please feel free to call me to discuss, or Kate and I can just iterate directly if that is easier (we are working together on the SCC/SCM section for a number of other rules anyway).

Thanks,

Elizabeth

Elizabeth Kopits, Ph.D.

National Center for Environmental Economics

Office of Policy, US EPA

1200 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, MC 1809T

Washington, DC 20460

(202) 566-2299

**From:** Marsh, Karen

**Sent:** Monday, June 01, 2015 1:31 PM

**To:** Vetter, Rick; Thundiyil, Karen; Kopits, Elizabeth

**Cc:** Ward, Hillary; Cozzie, David; Fulcher, Charles; Shouse, Kate

**Subject:** Landfills supplemental NSPS - SC-CH4 insert

Rick, Karen, and Elizabeth,

Attached for your review is language we intend to insert in the MSW Landfills NSPS Supplemental proposal related to the social-cost of methane. This text will go immediately following Table 1. Kate Shouse prepared the text and Charlie and I worked together to make a few minor edits, including only presenting the proposed option in Table 2 for consistency with what we have in the current version of the Emission Guidelines proposal.

Please review this text and let me know if you have any additional changes or edits and if this will suffice for discussion in the NSPS supplemental with further discussion available in the RIA.

Thanks,

Karen

\*\*\*\*\*

Karen R. Marsh, PE

US EPA, OAQPS, Sectors Policies and Programs Division

Fuels and Incineration Group

109 TW Alexander Drive, Mail Code E143-05

Research Triangle Park, NC 27711

Direct: (919) 541-1065; email: [marsh.karen@epa.gov](mailto:marsh.karen@epa.gov)